

# COMMUNITY CAPITALS FRAMEWORK INSTITUTE – FLIPCHARTS

## Presentations

### Watershed/Landscape Management: Limon, CR – Chiapas, Mexico

#### Community Capital Framework:

- Creates awareness of existing capitals – energizes confidence & action/empowerment
- Validation of data with local people
- Creation of indicators of different capitals with local community
- Integration of other tools (e.g. scorecard) and adapting them
- Promoting interventions that help communities to spiral up
- Sharing information between communities = bridging
- Importance of identifying the capital that is the driver (e.g. the river)
- Value of identifying both positive/negative
- capitals (impacts on livelihoods) or other capitals

#### Mary Nyasimi

- 1) Center of community is culture (cultural capital)
- 2) Point of intervention may be elsewhere (link between ancestors and soil degradation)
- 3) Bonding vs. bridging social capital – It's better to bridge with communities of same, not different ethnic group
- 4) Pluriactivity is ubiquitous, but has changed in nature – increased – and in geography dispersion. Impacts on alternatives for lower village?
- 5) Recognizing and fostering richness of local interpretation of capitals (difficulty of translating “capital” into local language)
- 6) Do we need to modify livelihoods framework in light of analysis of CCF?
- 7) Helping people identify how to spiral up – Importance of bringing results back to people and allowing them to reflect on and modify them. (True action research)
- 8) This should be done by encouraging transformative thinking.
- 9) Who will benefit from transformation? (Political capital – subordinate position of women is embedded in cultural system.)
- 10) Importance of women's organization and bridging of education for transformation

#### Hog CAFOs and ACCs:

- CAFOs ---- decreased Natural Capital
- CAFOs ---- decreased Human Capital (migration) lowered
- CAFOs ---- decreased Financial Capital, increased Poverty, decreased Home of values
- CAFOs ---- Not related to Social Capital
- How to simplify?
- Convention theory and capitals – Different conventions stress different capitals.  
Regulations/standards can separate from the driving norms and values.

#### Women Land and Legacy Lessons Learned

- Group negotiation of “assigning” date to CCF categories
- Women challenging top-down assistance; reformulating adult learning/education
- Importance of quantifying qualitative data – legitimacy of quantitative data
- Designing data collection to lead to what questions you want answered
- Value in training facilitators in analytical framework for better participant observation
- Can go back retroactively to analyze visioning or other kinds of data quantitatively and qualitatively

## **Community analysis**

- Use of census – block to get past limitation of county-level data
- Spatial organization of data allows display of relationships
- Analysis of data through Dunn & Broadstreet institutional listing – possibilities in utilizing credit data
- Census Block group data can be easily accessed for 10-year time series/trend analysis
- Used to quantify observed sub-county regional development analysis – capitals
- Do Capitals cluster?
- Can use factor-type analysis to determine indicators
- Clarification of indicators of capitals growing in importance...

### Challenges:

1. What are the limitations of CCF tool?
2. Different (qualitative and quantitative) methodologies and data (primary/secondary) sources.
3. Interdisciplinary Research Teams
4. How to make the CCF a valuable process for biophysical sciences

### **Stephen Gasteyer – What we learned:**

- 1) Bleeding of one capital into another
- 2) Clarification of purpose in gathering data
- 3) Legacy of ag. and mining – how captured in the capitals? Independent variables?
- 4) Appropriate units of analysis: Nested nature of indicators (region, subregion, County, community)
- 5) Define indigenous and exogenous factors. Definition of boundaries.
- 6) Using process lesson learned to change the way services are delivered to men/everyone and other kinds of farmers (alternative ag) (transferability with culturally appropriate modifications)

### **Tim Collins – Capitals, Human Agency, Land use**

- 1) What is important? What is knowledge? What drives the processes?
- 2) Importance of socio-cultural aspects
- 3) Linking of human agency and values to capitals
- 4) How we act does impact the system
- 5) Questions what we are told to do
- 6) Opens doors for transformative thinking – Cultural – Role of CCF
- 7) Brings it back to individual agency

### **Haroon – Research Question – How can CCF and SLF aid in priority setting for the CSRL Program Interventions?**

- Program Priorities --- Additional Research Efforts
  - Validation
  - M, E and IA
  - Cultural Capital
  - External Influences
  - Community Empowerment

F, N, S, C, H, P, B = Unknowns (External Systems) – all overlap

## Indicators

### Indicators:

- Provocative
- Short term, med term, long term
- Qualitative & Quantitative Indicators, data collection analysis
- Demo
- Evaluation
- Built – Political – Cultural – Process

### Natural Capital:

- Quantity/quality (water, soil, air, sources, # of rainfall)
- Natural landscape attractions
- Biodiversity (invasive, endogenous/monoculture)
- Hunting/fishing options – Gathering
- Aesthetics/amenities
- Energy sources
- Open/green space
- Food
- Green industry
- CO2, Ozone
- Climate change
- Weather – wind
- Farmer markets – Alternative Agriculture
- Protected areas
- Days of sunshine
- Types of natural disasters
- Community as ecosphere
- Medicinal plants
- People
- Degradation of natural features
- Rivers/lakes, mountains, canals -- Fungi, algae, pond scum
- Relation to financial, social & cultural capitals: forest, artesian well, pastures

### Cultural Capital:

- Heroes
- Traditional knowledge/practices
- Community celebration/festivals/rituals
- Conversation in the coffee shop/beauty shop
- Agreement on values/norms
- Differing on values/norms
- Shared identity/sense of place
- Sharing, reciprocity trust/positive use of conflu
- Consensus on property (real)
- Diversity – ethnic, religion, values, family structure
- # of churches/religions
- Language (recovery of local languages)

- Recognition of “other”/respect in community for new other/groups/individuals
- Legal system – education
- Art, theater, music, humanities
- Valuing others, youth, sacred places, historic preservation
- Perception of Civic Responsibility
- Creative class
- Envirocentrism
- Common weath
- Stories – Local practices
- Museums
- Local Radio/Newspapers/TV
- Library/Archives
- Movie Theater
- Mall/Town Square
- Food
- Ancestors
- Main Street Designation

**Political Capital:**

- Inst. Leadership
- Vision
- Direct
- Concensus
- Mobilize – Voice, number of community participation
- Long-term, new jobs and businesses, wellness, civic engagement, # involved, environment
- Who gets stuff on the agenda
- Inclusion – proportionate representation
- Opportunities for youth to participate in decisions
- Institutional efficacy and efficiency
- Mechanisms for compromise – outside, see what other do, is there an opportunity (email, public meetings, open community meetings)
- Voting patterns
- Exist Women’s League of Voters
- Content analysis – news and leaders
- Public access TV
- P.O. of participation
- Survey – perceptions of efficiency – tax use and fairness
- Balance budget – leverage \$\$
- Compliance with open meeting
- Are elections contested? Political tolerance? Kin seats
- Number of fines
- How often state and federal officials used
- Existence of government office
- Access to Political Leaders – wide, collective vs. narrow
- Ethics – Fair and reasonable courts and low percent
- Public/Private Partnerships
- Voice around regulation – Voice around everything and for everybody

- Individual roles in the community – participation in decision making, planning, organizations, participation in public hearings
- Transparency in policy development and regulation and enforcement
- Participation in reg. & state governments and units and organizations
- Legitimate democratic institutions
- Leverage plans and local resources
- Open meetings, budgets, records
- Gaining consensus – ballot measures, tax increases
- Participation in elected public offices – number of candidates, number of re-elected candidates, tenure, number of quantitative minorities
- Number of state and educational grants received (\$\$\$)
- Percent of eligible voter participation
- Political machinery -- number of candidates, number of re-elected candidates, tenure, number of quantitative minorities
- Proportional Representation in leadership (race, gender)
- Informal community leaders
- Community and Economical Development occur concurrently
- Free flow of information
- Role of non-profits and discovery groups
- Participatory research
- Collaboration and balance among market, state, and soc

#### **Built Capital:**

- Alt – Transportation -- number of buses or metro
- Public and private access
- Number of vacant industrial parks
- Water/sewer – capacity violations
- Churches
- Telecommunication – access to distance education
- Presence of learning places: community colleges, grade schools, high schools, universities, med/technical
- Level of community engagement – hours open to the public
- Public space – parks, community centers
- Broadband capacity
- Recreation
- Banks, credit facilities
- Roads and bridges
- Affordable housing
- Senior Centers
- Clinics, hospitals, health services, Crisis centers
- New construction, landscaping rehabilitation or reuse
- Funds available for renovation of infrastructure
- Number of historic sites/buildings – symbols
- Marketplaces – for local economy
- Retail outlets for necessities
- Hard structures
- Railroad, natural gas pipeline
- Airport

- Electric powerlines
- Hazardous waste treatment?
- Manufacturing facilities
- Prisons/Casinos/CAFOs
- Housing stock
- Industrial manufacturing
- Farm machinery
- Businesses (including coffee shops, restaurants)
- Public TV & radio – Media
- Daycare centers
- Main Street

### **Human Capital:**

- People
- Migration – net, gross in, gross out
- Personal responsibility
- Health – mental, behavioral, non-physical, acute and chronic
- Nutrition status
- Self-esteem, self-efficacy
- Legal status
- Lawyers
- Professional services
- Religious status
- Openness of opinions of others – youth retention
- Preserving/valuing elder wisdom – leverage int. cap.
- Valuing ideas of youth to others
- Leaders today
- Optimism – Can Do and passion
- Education Attainment – knowledge – Formal by category, literacy, numeracy – Informal, traditional knowledge, capacity building
- Skills
- Leadership Skills
- Diversity – Acceptance of diversity
- Philanthropy
- Thrift/Stewardship
- Life-long learning measures
- Facilitation

### **Social Capital:**

- Group responsibility for use and waste
- Diversity of number of civic organizations, church, and other organizations within the community and connected to outside the community
- Number of informal or natural social networks and diversity of groups – organization that shows bondage of all of these
- School and community involvement (number of parents involved, professional and team teaching involving local residents, number and type of student activities outside of school)

- Identifiable formal leadership roles (committee chairs, organization presidents, advisory councils, etc.)
- Available funding for social support
- Philanthropic organizations/funding
- Productive use of conflict
- Number of volunteer hours in the community organizations
- Level of conflict in the community
- Shifts in alliances/relationships
- Number of “bowling alleys” – choirs
- Labor and Human Rights organizations
- Churches, Barber Shops
- Number of jobs/family
- Average commute time
- Amount of volunteer contribution of time to community projects
- Social networks
- Lack of TV viewing – number of hours – lack of cable
- Trust
- Reciprocity
- “Decent respect for opinions of mankind”
- Leadership
- Regional/local (bridging/bonding)
- Number of community advocacy groups around community issues

**Financial Capital:**

- \$\$ available for technology
- Number of banks
- Unemployment rate (debtors?)
- Local loans (creditors??)
- Types of loans
- Credit Institutions
- Investments and investment strategies
- Real estate credit
- Property values
- Security brokerage
- Equity/locally-owned
- Percentage of homeowners
- Loan/deposit ratio
- IDAs
- Entrepreneurship
- Percentage of population – banked – Access
- Income/wealth distribution
- Pay Day Loan
- Number of livestock
- Bond rating for community
- Sources of income
- Support payment – Barter/Trade – informal lending
- Incentives
- Equity

- Deferments
- Percent of \$\$ spent locally
- Philanthropy
- Community foundations
- Collateral
- Remittances
- Community reinvestment
- Loan repayment
- Number of local businesses
- Farmgate values – value added
- Number of jobs, income, poverty, household, family, poverty
- External investment and internal investment
- Focus on wealth creation vs. income
- Percent of locally-owned businesses
- Per capita income

## Cultural Capital Sub-group Notes

(See Measuring Success - <http://www.ncrcrd.iastate.edu/pubs/contents/180.htm> )

Indicator	Methods/Processes
Coffee-shop conversation	Participant observation. Key informant. Content analysis of newspaper.
Identity Sense of place	Photovoice/video or camera Participation – take photos of meaningful places.
Community rituals, celebrations, sacred places	Take photos or videos of meaningful places. Number and types of local celebrations and participation in them. Interactions, meanings, etc. Use collage techniques with old magazines of newspapers. Drawings.
Language, valuing others	Published textbooks, children’s books, content analysis of curricula and records. Diverse leadership in local government. “sister-City’ relationships
Cultural differences are recognized and valued	Interviews with leadership. Document analysis. Check school lunch menus.
Language maintenance	Number of people who speak different languages. Interviews with leaders. Census data.
Retaining local knowledge	Number of people using traditional health practices. Document analysis oat health centers. Interviews. Interviews with community members.
Maintenance of traditional crops/medicinal crops	Interviews with community members.
Traditional knowledge and practices	Interviews. Observations. Key informants.
Family/household culture	Interviews about family activities. Diaries Camera documentation. What members do together. Foods used/preferred.
Celebration of ancestors	Cemetery visits. Observations of photos on walls/display. Availability of family tree and histories.
Local cultural, values, celebration of history	Analyze content of potluck and community dinners.

## Discussion on Presentations

## Application of CCF

- Unit of analysis
- Inst. Unit of analysis + assets/indicators + also mediating investment of capital

### **Suggested Improvements:**

- Learn from nature – impacts on other capitals & potential collaboration between them (Tim & Isabel)
- Need to develop secondary data indicators of capitals – 1) as a platform for launching a participatory approach, and 2) depiction of broad situation & triangulation
- How do you tailor capitals for specific audiences
- Using capitals for empowerment of community – a) helping communities to understand what is happening to them, b) aiding them to implement their vision, c) measuring progress toward vision, and d) reinterpreting vision in terms of broader understanding of communities
- Triangulation = linking qualitative and quantitative
- Use of Qualitative data for over time: a) Interpreting meaning of qualitative by gathered data – who does interpreting and when, and b) Quantifying qualitative data

### **Where are the leverage points to reverse the spiral down?**

- \$\$\$ can bring arrows together temporarily – temp or any magnetic field
- Can you turn temporary alignment into ongoing with multiple years visits?
- Less \$\$ = Social Capital
- Infusion across the capitals
- Something visible – train-the-trainers, small grants, barrier to new action
- Test special issues
- How to integrate CC leadership, social

**Appreciative Inquiry Process: What can we learn from our use of the CCF and how can that learning expand and enhance our use of CCF?**

**Positive Core (AI) What facilitates successful use of CCF in research?**

- Appropriate to site
- Flexible
- Interrelatedness – ecology linkages
- Comprehensive
- Empowerment/co learning – action research
- Inter-discussion
- Multiple methods
- Situate research and people for next round
- Validate/challenge data collection
- Process inputs and outputs
- New inst. Relationships – bridging
- Way to look at balance
- Dynamic
- Helps us see things differently

**Positive Core (whole group):**

- Empowerment capacity
- Understanding transcends disciplines
- Ecology among capitals
- Participatory
- Drawing on multiple methods
- Holistic
- Builds institutional relationships
- Grounded in context
- Dynamic and flexible
- Systems change
- Process emphasis
- Positions you for next round of research or action

**What would it look like if it were even better?**

- Participants actively involved in analysis is essential
- If it could do both: local empowerment and global/comparative indicators
- Organization visits to other communities
- Could be identified at different levels
- Joint analysis of data
- Meta-analysis of CCF work and use of indicators
- Build contextualized local indicators around comparative indicators
- Thru research engender consciousness of capitals and resources
- Develop complementary methods/tools (e.g. mapping to data meaning)
- Use qualitative data over time
  - a. Interpret meaning of this data – who does this and when
  - b. How to quantify qualitative data
- Better way to incorporate feedback to analysis

- Local empowerment and global comparative indicators (linking visioning with CCF to implement and measure progress and re-interpret vision)
- Develop secondary data indicators to launch participatory research
- Depict larger situation
- Contribute to triangulation
- Linking of levels
- Tailoring capitals to specific audience to maximize meaning/effect
- Interactive, online workbook to share knowledge
- Engender CC consciousness to stimulate community development of indicators and action

**What would it look like if our use of CCF led to even more useful and successful research efforts?**

- Participants actively involved in analysis is essential
- If it could do both: local empowerment and global/comparative indicators
- Organization visits to other communities
- Could be identified at different levels
- Joint analysis of data
- Meta-analysis of CCF work and use of indicators
- Build contextualized local indicators around comparative indicators
- Thru research engender consciousness of capitals and resources
- Develop complementary methods/tools (e.g. mapping to data meaning)
- Use qualitative data over time
  - c. Interpret meaning of this data – who does this and when
  - d. How to quantify qualitative data
- Better way to incorporate feedback to analysis
- Local empowerment and global comparative indicators (linking visioning with CCF to implement and measure progress and re-interpret vision)
- Develop secondary data indicators to launch participatory research
- Depict larger situation
- Contribute to triangulation
- Linking of levels
- Tailoring capitals to specific audience to maximize meaning/effect
- Interactive, online workbook to share knowledge
- Engender CC consciousness to stimulate community development of indicators and action

**Provocative Propositions:**

- Research is a facilitator rather than an agent
- Joint analysis of data
- Learn from nature to define impacts (biomimicry)
- Meta-analysis of CCF studies
- Restructure relationships with funders and our relations with them to lead to outcomes-based work
- Allow others to learn from other communities (build into research design)
- Find good open source software to do qualitative analysis

## Summary comments

### What people liked:

- Discussion of measurement
- Nice way to get feedback
- Other people contribute from their own work
- Find things in common
- Grasp common themes
- Identifies dissertations
- Set context
- Looking for language to talk to the city council
- Interaction of capitals
- Writing the 3<sup>rd</sup> edition
- Better understanding for work
- Better understanding for evaluation
- How are people using it?
- Provides a framework for evaluations
- Tool and ideas
- Measure impact on the community and individual
- Ideas, learning, sharing
- Listening to how others use it
- Networking
- Exploring issues of measurement
- Identify capital indicators
- More understanding of qualitative
- Better relations/local , fed & global community capital
- Better understanding of framework and ideas on application
- Clarify methodological elements

### What people learned:

- Discussion of indicators
- Common strands help us learn
- Engage people in individual indicators
- Method
- Ecology of indicators – bleed into each other
- Role of cultural capital and disconnect with individual Actions
- Marrying 2<sup>nd</sup> data to indicators
- Difficulty in publishing what might be useful to people

### Things we can do together:

- Add people to list serv
- Meta analysis (weigh – bias, completeness) – rules of thumb – context, data
- How is it used in CD work? – conference calls
- How is it used in research? – conference calls vs. roundtables
- Best practices in measurement – 2<sup>nd</sup> web/interactive measuring success
- Share info/get input via the Internet and conference calls

**Next year:**

- Participatory analysis
- Complementary tools
- Indicators Update